Open Data Barometer Questions (from the 2014 Web Index Survey)

The Open Data Barometer feeds into the main Web Index, and a separate annual report.

Before answering or reviewing Barometer questions it is important to familiarise yourself with the concept of open government data fully.

A good resource for this can be found at [http://opengovernmentdata.org/](http://opengovernmentdata.org/) and further information can be found in the Open Data Handbook [http://opendatahandbook.org/en/](http://opendatahandbook.org/en/)

(Note, question numbers are non-sequential) Open data barometer variable names are in [square brackets]

**P5) To what extent is there a robust legal or regulatory framework for protection of personal data in your country? [ODB.2013.C.DPL]**

**Scoring Criteria**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>10</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>0</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A legal or regulatory data protection framework exists that is broadly applicable, provides the right of choice/consent to individuals, provides the right to access and/or correct one's personal data, imposes clear responsibilities on information holders and provides a right of redress against both private and public bodies that violate data privacy.</td>
<td>A legal or regulatory regime exists but is missing some of the key elements understood to promote best practice around data protection policies, including broad applicability, the right of choice/consent to individuals, the right to access and/or correct one's personal data, clear responsibilities on information holders, and/or the right of redress against both private and public bodies that violate data privacy.</td>
<td>A legal or regulatory regime to promote data protection does not exist or is so devoid of precision and/or the understood best practice as to render it useless in practice.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Evidence and scoring thresholds:**

**For a score of above 0 to be awarded:** there should be evidence of a legal or regulatory policy to promote data protection of some form.

**For a score of above 3 to be awarded:** there should be evidence that the legal or regulatory policy that promotes data protection is concise and useful in practice. some cases where it
was used and applied should be provided.

**For a score of above 5** to be awarded: there should be evidence that the legal or regulatory policy that promotes data protection exists but is missing some of the key elements understood to promote best practice around data protection policies, including broad applicability, the right of choice/consent to individuals, the right to access and/or correct one’s personal data, clear responsibilities on information holders (data-controllers), and/or the right of redress against both private and public bodies that violate data privacy.

**For a score above 8** to be awarded: there should be evidence that the legal or regulatory law that promotes data protection exists and is applicable, provides the right of choice/consent to individuals, provides the right to access and/or correct one’s personal data, imposes clear responsibilities on information holders (data-controllers) and provides a right of redress against both private and public bodies that violate data privacy.

**Scoring Guidance**

Strong data protection regimes include the key features noted below, namely broad applicability, the right of consent, the right to access and correct the information, obligations on data controllers, and the right of redress.

(1) Broad applicability – these rules should apply to personal data sets and data controllers in both the public and private sectors.

(2) The right of choice/consent – Individuals should normally be given the choice of whether their information is collected. There should be only limited exceptions to this where there is an overriding interest, defined in law, in the collection of such information. This implies that individuals understand and are given clear notice of a public or private body’s information practices before any personal information is collected. This notification should describe what information is proposed to be collected and held, who will collect it, how the information will be used and who will have access to it. It should also be clear to the subject whether the provision of the requested information is voluntary or required by law and of the consequences of refusing to provide the requested information. Information should not be used for purposes that are incompatible with the use for which the information was originally collected.

(3) The right to access and correct – Individuals should have the right of access to any information held about them at reasonable intervals and without undue delay. They should also have the right to require the data controller to correct any inaccuracies or to delete the data, where appropriate.

(4) The responsibilities of information holders – Data controllers must take reasonable steps
to ensure that the information they hold is accurate and secure. Access to the data should be limited in accordance with the established uses of the data. Transfers should be made only to third parties that can ensure similar respect for data protection principles. Data should be destroyed once the information is no longer needed for the established uses, or converted to anonymous form. While information is held, appropriate steps should be taken to ensure the confidentiality, integrity and quality of the data.

(5) The right of redress – Individuals should have the right of redress against public and private bodies that fail to respect data protection rules in relation to data about them. Remedies can be provided through self-regulation, private law actions and government enforcement. Oversight of the system should be undertaken by an independent body.

Source Guidance

- This 2012 paper (http://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=2000034) provides a list of 89 countries with data protection laws and the names of the laws to assist in researching whether a law is effectively implemented;
- Interviews with senior officials from the information commission or data protection commission;
- Interviews with NGO officers with expertise in data protection and access-to-information issues and also investigative journalists;
- Experts in data privacy, information privacy or access to information, such as academics, researchers and think tanks;
- Reports published by the media, academic and policy journals, and development and multilateral bodies (e.g., World Bank, IFC, OECD, African Development Bank).
P6). To what extent does the country have a functioning Right to Information (RTI) / Freedom of Information (FoI) law? [ODB.2013.C.RTI]

Scoring Criteria

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>10</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>0</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Citizens generally receive responses to requests for government information within a reasonable time period and at a reasonable cost, and responses are typically of acceptable quality. An RTI or FoI law or similar legal right enshrines the right to such requests.</td>
<td>Citizens may not receive timely responses to requests for government information, or responses are missing key information. The right to request government information may be generally guaranteed by a vague constitutional right but is not further protected by a dedicated law or enforceable regulation.</td>
<td>Requests for government information are generally not responded to at all, or responses are of extremely low quality. There may be no right-to-information or FoI law at all.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Evidence and scoring thresholds:

For a score of above 0 to be awarded: there should be evidence of some form of legal or regulatory right to information from government, even though it might not be implemented. Policy statements have been made that this issue will be addressed in government policy, although implementation remains weak.

For a score of above 3 to be awarded: there should be evidence that the legal or regulatory right to information law is responded to when there are requests for the information, through a dedicated agency or channel, although the response time may be slow and the quality of the information provided may not be as requested. Implementation is patchy and not yet widespread.

For a score of above 5 to be awarded: there should be evidence that the legal or regulatory regime which exists guarantees citizens access to information. A dedicated agency exists to deal with enquiries and to adjudicate cases or request for information from government that are refused. Response rate from this agency is fairly prompt (within a few months).

For a score above 8 to be awarded: there should be evidence that citizens generally receive responses to requests for government information within the legally stipulated time as governed by the RTI / FoI law and at the cost defined by law. The responses are typically of acceptable quality. An RTI law or similar legal right enshrines the right to such requests. There is a dedicated agency that adjudicates cases that are refused by the government, and
this role is taken seriously and there is evidence of its work being effective and respected.

Scoring Guidance

This indicator addresses whether the country’s disclosure requirements are “effective.” The basic requirements for them to be considered “effective” are whether information is: a) available to the public for free or at reasonable/minimal costs in a variety of venues (e.g., online, government agency offices), b) can be accessed by citizens within a timeframe as defined by the law, and c) answers the specific request, with explanations for refusal to release information.

For a 10 score, there can be exceptions in which information is not released to protect national security or public interests clearly prescribed by law (e.g., medical records, sexual orientation, etc.), but the legal reason must be stated clearly in the response from the government to the citizen who requested the information.

Source Guidance

- Assessment of RTI laws in practice: Global Integrity, Category I-3 [www.globalintegrity.org];
- Interviews with NGO officers with expertise in access-to-information issues and investigative journalists;
- If there is a national agency in charge of handling appeals to denials for request of information, then researchers should interview government officials who work for this agency to obtain a sense of the conditions in which an agency denies (or grants) information;
- Reports published by the information agency, media reports and publications by development/donor agencies;
- For researchers to find statistics, they should refer to the national statistical agency or the appropriate governmental agency that houses statistical information;
- Non-exhaustive databases of right-to-information laws can be found at RTI Rating [www.rti-rating.org] and from the Public Accountability Mechanisms [www.agidata.org/pam] database;
- You can check existing assessments of RTI laws in practice: Global Integrity, Category I-3 [www.globalintegrity.org];
- Conversations with NGO officers with expertise in access-to-information issues and investigative journalists;
- Reports published by the information agency, media reports and publications by development/donor agencies;
- Principles on national security and right to information (http://www.opensocietyfoundations.org/sites/default/files/global-principles-national-se
Reference resource: Web Index Survey Handbook (Open Data Barometer extract) 
www.opendatabarometer.org/report/about/
curity-10232013.pdf)
C1) To what extent is there a well-resourced open government data initiative in this country? [ODB.2013.C.INIT]

Scoring Criteria

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>10</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>0</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>There is a strong national open data initiative with significant resources behind it, including dedicated staff and budgets. There is explicit commitment to open data from a senior government figure (e.g. Cabinet minister) and/or parliamentary backing for an open data initiative.</td>
<td>There is a small-scale open data initiative, or an open data initiative has been announced but is not yet resourced. Senior leadership is making commitments to increased government transparency, and/or some commitments to open data are being expressed by a junior minister / single ministry.</td>
<td>There is no evidence of a formal open data initiative, nor any commitment from government to release open data.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Scoring Guidance

Look for evidence of an explicit government commitment to open data.

An open data initiative is a programme by the government to release government data online to the public. It has four main features:

1. The government discloses data or information without request from citizens. This may be according to a release schedule or ad hoc.
2. The Internet is the primary means of disclosure. Mobile phone applications may also be used for disclosure.
3. Data is free to access and re-use, e.g. open licenses;
4. Data is in a machine-readable format to enable computer-based reuse, e.g. spreadsheet formats, Application Programming Interface (API).

Look for all these features in the policy you are assessing for it to receive the maximum scores.

The ten principles of open government data are:

1. Completeness
2. Primacy
3. Timeliness
4. Ease of Physical and Electronic Access
5. Machine readability
6. Non-discrimination
7. Use of Commonly Owned Standards
8. Licensing
9. Permanence
10. Usage Costs

For more information on what these principles entail see:

Significant resources for an open government data initiative include a sufficient budget, personnel and facilities to carry out the mandate of the open data initiative, including technical personnel with appropriate qualifications for dealing with open data issues.

Note that this question is only concerned with initiatives led by the national government. Open data initiatives covering the country, but organised by a third party, such as the African Development Bank or another regional organisation should not be counted, although you can detail these in the 'Additional notes' section.

Source Guidance

- The existence of a government open data action plans, policy or directive
- Speeches by government leaders about open data
- Conversations with members of the open data movement, both government and civil society
- Conversations with the “civic hacker” community
- Open Government Partnership country action plans (www.opengovpartnership.org) that contain explicit commitments to open data. See also the dataset of commitments at http://www.opengovpartnership.org/blog/joe-foti/2014/04/30/ogps-independent-reporting-mechanism-releases-beta-version-data-first-43
- Reports published by the media, academic and policy journals, and development and multilateral bodies (e.g., World Bank Open Data Readiness Assessment, IFC, OECD, African Development Bank).
Reference resource: Web Index Survey Handbook (Open Data Barometer extract)
www.opendatabarometer.org/report/about/
C4) To what extent are civil society and information technology professionals engaging with the government regarding open data? [ODB.2013.C.CSOC]

Scoring Criteria

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>10</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>0</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>There are coordinated campaign(s) calling for open data or working with governments to promote open data. There are several engaged groups using open government data, and outreach events and activities may be conducted to promote use of open data. The government regularly engages with the user community.</td>
<td>There is some demand or engagement over open data from individuals or communities, but it may be isolated. There is no coordinated campaign for open data usage, and the government does not engage the community regularly.</td>
<td>There is little, if any, evidence of demand or use of open data.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Scoring Guidance

Campaigns for open data are often composed of civil society organizations, data technologists, informational professionals, computer experts and ordinary citizens who advocate for greater access to government data. A 10 score indicates that government officials recognize these organized campaigns and engage in discussion with community leaders about which data to release, when and in what forms.

Source Guidance

- Online evidence of an open data community, including reports of events and other activities;
- Conversations with open data specialists in civil society organizations or individuals who are directing open data campaigns;
- Conversations with government officials working in open data offices or projects;
- Conversations with NGO officers with expertise in open-data and access-to-information issues, and investigative journalists;
- Reports published by the media, academic and policy journals, and development and multilateral bodies (e.g., Open Knowledge Foundation, Sunlight Foundation, etc.);
C6) To what extent is government directly supporting a culture of innovation with open data through competitions, grants or other support? [ODB.2013.C.SUPIN]

Scoring Criteria

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>10</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>0</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The government has made a substantial commitment to support a culture of innovation with open data, including significant financial incentives and supporting a range of different activities. These include events targeting private sector use of open data. Multiple government departments are involved in supporting innovation with open data.</td>
<td>There are a range of interventions to support a culture of innovation. For example, there are three or more examples of competitions, funding schemes or hackathon events run by government AND two or more departments or agencies are involved in running these schemes.</td>
<td>There is no government support for innovation using open data.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Scoring Guidance

Governments can adopt a range of approaches to stimulate a culture of innovation around open data including:

- **Running competitions** in which prize money is offered to innovators creating tools, services or commercial applications using open data;
- **Organising hackathon events** which invite developers to create prototype tools and services over one or two day events;
- **Organising incubators and open data boot camps** specifically targeted at supporting innovative uses of open data;
- **Offering grant funding or innovation vouchers** specifically targeted at encouraging businesses to engage with open data;

Sometimes these are run as one-off activities, organised with minimal budgets by small groups of staff. In these cases, a maximum score of 5 should be given. To receive a score of 10 there should be clear evidence of government dedicating investment to support innovation with open data, including support to private sector re-users of open data.

If you find a number of non-government activities to support innovation with open data you may include details of these in the additional notes field, but only events with significant government involvement should feature in the score you give.

Source Guidance
● Conversations with open data activists, government officials involved in open data, or entrepreneurs working on open data in the country;
● Search for government press releases and announcements about support for open data innovation activities;
● Search for donor press releases, project funding documents and announcements of support for open data innovation activities;
● Search for ‘hack days’, ‘open data boot camps’, ‘open data competitions’ and check to identify if any of these were supported by government;
C5) To what extent are city, regional and local governments running their own open data initiatives? [ODB.2013.C.CITY]

Scoring Criteria

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>10</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>0</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>All of the largest cities and regions in the country have open data initiatives. The majority of these have strong political backing and are well resourced.</td>
<td>A number of different cities or regions across the country have open data initiatives. These may be predominantly run by civil society, or may have limited resources dedicated to them. Open data initiatives exist in cities and regions beyond the national or state capitals.</td>
<td>There are no city or regional open data initiatives.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Scoring Guidance

Open government data does not just involve central government. Regional, city and local government may all adopt open data initiatives.

You can find a list of the largest cities by population for each country from the source information at [https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/List_of_largest_cities_and_second_largest_cities_by_country](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/List_of_largest_cities_and_second_largest_cities_by_country).

For a score of 10 check the top-10 cities by population. For federal systems, check the 10 largest States by population.

The criteria of an open data initiative are the same as in C1.

Source Guidance

- Conversations with open data specialists in civil society organizations or individuals who are directing open data campaigns;
- Conversations with government officials working in open data offices or projects;
- Conversations with NGO officers with expertise in open-data and access-to-information issues, and investigative journalists;
- Searching for data portals and platforms run by cities or regions;
• Reports published by the media, academic and policy journals, and development and multilateral bodies (e.g., Open Knowledge Foundation, Sunlight Foundation, etc.);
C7) To what extent is training about open data available for individuals or businesses who want to increase their technical skills or develop businesses to use open data? [ODB.2013.C.TRAIN]

Scoring Criteria

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>10</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>0</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>There is widespread access to high quality training covering the full range of open data issues, such as data technology, data science and statistics, data visualisation and the business and legal aspects of open data. Both basic and advanced training are available from a range of different providers and in a range of cities and locations across the country. Much of the training provided is ‘world class’ and would equip those trained to operate in a global marketplace.</td>
<td>There is limited access to training on open data issues, such as data technology, data science and statistics, data visualisation and the business and legal aspects of open data. Whilst there may be some examples of training that would equip those trained to operate in a global marketplace, the majority of training may be of middling or low quality.</td>
<td>There is very limited training available, or those wishing to learn have to access training from outside the country.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Scoring Guidance

Working with open data involves a wide range of knowledge and skills, including:

- **Web technologies** - covering issues such as web development, publishing data on the web, and building applications with open data for a range of platforms, including mobile;
- **Data science** - covering core statistical skills, and the ability to work with large online datasets from heterogeneous sources;
- **Data visualisation** - covering design and programming skills to create interactive and static data visualisations and infographics;
- **Legal aspects of open data** - addressing issues such as the licensing of open datasets, and legal issues in open source, open data and open knowledge;
- **Business aspects of open data** - addressing the creation of commercial enterprises on top of open data or open source - delivered through formal training or business mentoring and incubation programmes;
Training may be delivered through i), both full-time and part-time, or through professional development courses. Training may also be delivered through business incubator programmes, or short-term boot-camp training events.

Where training events are one-off, or short-term donor funded interventions in one or two locations in the country, the maximum score available should be 5. Where training on the majority of the topics noted above is accessible to businesses and individuals in the country who may be interested in it, then a score of 10 should be given.

Where online training is available in languages accessible to businesses and individuals in the country, and there is evidence that this training is used by nationals of the country, then this may count towards your assessment of ‘limited access to training’ (5), but online only courses should not be taken to count towards ‘widespread access to training’ (10).

Source Guidance

- Conversations with developers and technology businesses interested in developing their open data capacity to identify the training they access;
- Conversations with training providers about the courses offered and the range of courses available;
- Course directories and promotional material from further and higher education providers;
- Web searches for training providers on the particular topics noted above;
Open Data Impact questions

I1 to I6 ask you to assess the degree to which there is any evidence that *open data release by the country government* has had impacts in a variety of different domains in the country.

The question Scoring Criteria invite you to look for credible claims made in academic publications, mainstream media and online sources which explicitly attribute certain impacts to open data released by the countries government. The highest scores are only available where there is peer-reviewed or audited evidence of impact.

We anticipate that in the 2014 Barometer there will be very few countries that score the highest scores, and some countries may have very low scores on this question.

Question I6 asks about entrepreneurial use of open data.

### A note on ‘impact’

Measuring impact is notoriously difficult. Establishing a solid causal connection between open data and particular changes is clearly beyond the scope of a survey such as the Web Index. However, for the purpose of the Web Index, claims made in credible sources concerning possible impacts of open data are a useful proxy indicator of areas in which impact may be occurring, and to allow initial comparison between countries.

Claims about impact go beyond simple descriptions of where open data has been used. For example, a newspaper might report that open data has been used to create a bus timetables application, to visualise the budget of the country, or in a hackathon focussed on public services. It is only when they relate this to some other outcome, such as budget savings, or an increase in use of public transport, that an impact claim has been made.

### General Scoring Guidance

With the exception of question I6, for each topic area you should carefully check to ensure the impacts you cite can be reasonably attributed to open government data from the country in question. For example, a crowdsourcing application created by an NGO to monitor public services may contribute to more efficient government, but if it does not use open data from government then, for the purposes of these questions, you should not include it in your analysis. By contrast, if a government publishes data on its spending, and there are cases of third-parties using this to highlight where government could use its resources more efficiently, this would count as a case where impact could be cited from open government data.
Where examples draw on open data from outside the country (e.g. an ICT based in the country is using open data from the World Bank, some other government, or some global dataset) you may report this in Justifications and Sources, but these examples should not count towards scores higher than 5, as higher scores are only available where the data being used comes from the national government’s open data releases.

The top score (10) should only be given where at least one credible peer reviewed article clearly attributes measurable impacts to open data and there are further cases of impact in other credible media sources and blog posts etc.

Remember to focus on cases of open data released by national government in making your score assessments. You may include details of city level examples as additional notes in your justification.

The justification of ‘widespread impacts’ should include examples cited from at least three different sectors (e.g. health, education, transport).

11) To what extent has open data had a noticeable impact on increasing government efficiency and effectiveness? [ODB.2013.I.GOV]

**Scoring Criteria**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>10</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>0</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Open data is widely cited to have made a significant contribution to government efficiency, with rigorous evidence to back these claims: for example a peer-reviewed study or government audit showing the contribution of open data to government efficiency.</td>
<td>Two or more cases in the media or credible online sources where open data is cited to have contributed to increased government efficiency</td>
<td>No evidence of impact.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Scoring Guidance**

Open data could lead to improvements in government efficiency and effectiveness in a number of ways:

- By enabling government departments to better plan and target resources;
Reference resource: Web Index Survey Handbook (Open Data Barometer extract)
www.opendatabarometer.org/report/about/

- By allowing outside actors to scrutinise government use of resources and highlight areas for savings;
- By enabling outside actors to build new services on top of open data which deliver more effective public services;
- By supporting collaboration between different government departments;

You may find other ways that open data impacts government efficiency and effectiveness in addition to these.

Source Guidance

- Conversations with open data experts, government officials, NGOs and media;
- Reports and case studies from government departments, international organisations and NGOs;
- Media reports from domestic or international media;
- Blog posts and forum discussions;

For the purpose of this indicator, if no relevant open government data is available the score should be 0.
I2) To what extent has open data had a noticeable impact on increasing transparency and accountability in the country? [ODB.2013.I.ACCOUNT]

Scoring Criteria

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>10</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>0</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Open data is widely cited to have made a significant contribution to increased transparency and accountability, with rigorous evidence to back these claims: for example, a peer-reviewed study showing a positive impact on transparency and accountability.</td>
<td>Two or more cases in the media or credible online sources where open data is cited to have contributed to greater transparency and accountability.</td>
<td>No evidence of impact.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Scoring Guidance

Open data could lead to improvements in government transparency and accountability in a number of ways:

- Supporting journalism and data journalism which uncovers wasteful spending, corruption or other wrongdoing by government departments or officials;
- Supporting the creation of applications which allow citizens to report on their experience of government services (for example, when a directory of schools or hospitals helps third-parties build a school or healthcare performance reporting application for citizens);
- Supporting scrutiny of government decision making;
- Supporting greater citizen engagement in policy making;

You may find other ways that open data impacts government transparency and accountability in addition to these.

This question is intended to evaluate whether open data is being used by civil society, individuals or non-government professionals to increase government transparency and accountability. Examples include applications to leverage open data around budgets, expenditure tracking, procurement, taxation and policy making, as well as accountability mechanisms such as financial disclosure, conflict-of-interest restrictions, audit systems and anti-corruption efforts.
Researchers should first check the websites of ministries such as health, education, transportation or agriculture for available open data. They should also check for national open data portals that make data available to the community free of charge (e.g., Open Data Kenya, Healthdata.gov, Data.gov.uk). If there is available open data in a country, further investigation should be done to evaluate the extent that this data is used to improve government transparency and accountability.

For the purpose of this indicator, if no relevant open government data is available the score should be 0.

Source Guidance

- Conversations with open data experts, government officials, NGOs and media;
- Reports and case studies from government departments, international organisations and NGOs;
- Media reports from domestic or international media;
- Blog posts and forum discussions;
13) To what extent has open data had a noticeable impact on environmental sustainability in the country? [ODB.2013.I.ENV]

**Scoring Criteria**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>10</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>0</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Open data is widely cited to have made a significant contribution to the environmental sustainability, with rigorous evidence to back these claims: for example a peer-reviewed study showing the impact of an open dataset on environmental sustainability.</td>
<td>Two or more cases in the media or credible online sources where open data is cited to have had an impact on environmental sustainability.</td>
<td>No evidence of impact.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Scoring Guidance**

Open data could lead to impacts on environment sustainability in a number of ways:

- Through enabling greater scrutiny of pollution impacts or environmental impacts of government projects or private enterprise;
- Through supporting greater attention to be paid to environmental factors in planning projects;
- Through encouraging government buildings to make more efficient use of energy;
- Through raising citizens awareness of their own environmental impacts;
- Through supporting campaigns on environmental issues;

You may find other ways that open data impacts environmental sustainability in addition to these.

You may include in your assessment open datasets which, whilst not directly published by government, are published as a result of a government mandate. For example, where a regulator may requires that factories publish pollution statistics. However, you should check that the published data is open data, licensed for reuse in these cases.

This question is intended to evaluate whether open data is being used by civil society, individuals or non-government professionals to enhance environmental sustainability. Examples of areas where open data can be applied are alternative energy (solar, wind, hydro), energy-efficient construction, pollution (air, water, soil), water usage, waste management and sewage treatment, recycling programs and climate change.
Researchers should first check the websites of ministries such as health, education, transportation or agriculture for available open data. They should also check for national open data portals that make data available to the community free of charge (e.g., Open Data Kenya, Healthdata.gov, Data.gov.uk). If there is available open data in a country, further investigation should be done to evaluate the extent that this data is used to enhance environmental sustainability.
For the purpose of this indicator, if no relevant open government data is available the score should be 0.

Source Guidance

- Conversations with open data experts, government officials, NGOs and media;
- Reports and case studies from government departments, international organisations and NGOs;
- Media reports from domestic or international media;
- Blog posts and forum discussions;
14) To what extent has open data had a noticeable impact on increasing the inclusion of marginalised groups in policy making and accessing government services? [ODB.2013.I.INC]

Scoring Criteria

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>10</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>0</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Open data is widely cited to have made a significant contribution to the inclusion of marginalised groups, with rigorous evidence to back these claims: for example a peer-reviewed study showing the greater inclusion of at least one marginalised group.</td>
<td>Two or more cases in the media or credible online sources where open data is cited to have allowed marginalised groups to participate in either policy making, or accessing government services.</td>
<td>No evidence of impact.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Scoring Guidance

All societies have certain groups who are marginalised. This may be on grounds of age, gender, race, tribe, caste, class, disability, geographic location, and levels of poverty. Whilst these groups are not prohibited by licenses or technical mechanisms from accessing and using open data, they may not always be able to have effective access to open data. It has been argued however that open data can lead to more inclusive policy making and government services.

This may happen through the direct use of open data by marginalised groups, or through the work of intermediary organisations who support marginalised groups to access and use data, or who use data to campaign for the greater inclusion of marginalised groups in decision making or in receiving the benefits of public services.

Source Guidance

- Conversations with open data experts, government officials, NGOs and media;
- Reports and case studies from government departments, international organisations and NGOs;
- Media reports from domestic or international media;
- Blog posts and forum discussions;

For the purpose of this indicator, if no relevant open government data is available the score should be 0.
I5) To what extent has open data had a noticeable positive impact on the economy? [ODB.2013.I.ECON]

**Scoring Criteria**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>10</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>0</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Clear rigorous evidence of a contribution of open data to a range of forms of new economic activity and/or economic growth; for example, a peer-reviewed study showing a positive impact on economic growth across a number of sectors.</td>
<td>Multiple cases in the media or credible online sources where open data is cited to have contributed to economic growth in at least two different sectors.</td>
<td>No evidence of impact.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Scoring Guidance**

Open data may impact on the economy in a number of ways. For example:

- Through supporting the creation of new businesses based on open data;
- Through supporting existing businesses to lower their costs or become more efficient (for example, using weather or transport data to better plan their operations)
- Through supporting better economic planning;

You can read about a range of open data business models at:

There are many articles concerning the potential contribution of open data to economic growth, but to score 10, studies or credible sources cited should be about actual observe economic growth, rather than forecasts of potential economic impacts from open data.

**Source Guidance**

- Conversations with businesses, open data experts, government officials, NGOs and media;
- Reports and case studies from government departments, international organisations and NGOs;
- Media reports from domestic or international media;
- Blog posts and forum discussions;
I6) To what extent are entrepreneurs successfully using open data to build new businesses in the country? [ODB.2013.I.ENTR]

**Scoring Criteria**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>10</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>0</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>There are five or more examples of successful and thriving new businesses based around open data, employing staff and/or attracting significant external investment.</td>
<td>There are small scale examples of commercial apps, websites or other businesses built with open data. These remain niche or small scale businesses.</td>
<td>There is no evidence of entrepreneurial use of open data.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Scoring Guidance**

This question focuses specifically on entrepreneurial use of open government data. See I5 for details of business models around open data.

An entrepreneurial use of open data involves a company that:

- Earns revenue from its products and services, and
- Use open government data as a key resource for its business.

Be careful to distinguish business based on open data (explicitly citing certain open datasets as a key input into their work) from businesses based around open source software. Open source software is distinct from open data, and open source businesses do not count towards scores for this question.

**Source Guidance**

- Conversations with businesses, open data experts, government officials, NGOs and media;
- Reports and case studies from government departments, international organisations and NGOs;
- Media reports from domestic or international media;
- Blog posts and forum discussions;
Dataset questions

To assess how far open data policies are being implemented the following questions ask you about whether government makes available data on a range of different topics in this country, and where the best sources for that data may be.

The information you give here will be used by our open data technical assessors to identify the availability and quality of open data.

Through these questions we are also collecting important qualitative data to improve assessment models for open data in future.

For each of the categories below you will be asked to select from the four options:

- Data not held by government at all
- Data collected, but not shared
- Data shared, but not as open data
- Data shared as open data

If the data is not held by government at all, you will be asked to fill in two supplementary questions:

1) Please explain why the government does not hold this data.

   There may be a number of different reasons that government cannot make certain dataset available, including a lack of capacity to collect the data, or the data in question being managed at a local rather than national level. Please provide a short description, supported by relevant links, of why this data is not available.

2) Does government mandate that third parties should share this data?

Sometimes governments use 'targeted transparency' policies to mandate that third parties should disclose certain datasets (for example, when government requires companies to publish pollutant information, demands that private sector transport providers share timetable data, or requires local government to publish certain datasets in a standard format). If there is evidence that government is requiring third-party sharing of this kind of data, please provide details here.

Start your answer with 'YES' or 'NO' and then provide details.
If the data is held by government, you will be asked three supplementary questions:

3) Which agency or agencies are responsible for this data?

Please provide details of the agency, departments or bodies that collect and manages this data, and including links to their website(s), and any web pages which detail their responsibility for providing this data.

If there are limitations on the data collected (e.g. a census has been delayed, or a land-registry that is incomplete), please also details those here.

4) Please provide links to where the data can be found. You may include multiple sources, including open data sources where relevant.

Number links and separate each link with a line-break. Before each link please provide a few words description of the source.

E.g. "Contracts finder - online search - non-open: <link>;

Contracts dataset - on national data catalogue - open data <link>"

5) Is the data available as open data from a third party?

Sometimes third parties take non-machine readable open data (e.g. data in PDFs) and turn it into machine-readable open data which they then re-publish. If your research locates examples like this, or other examples where a third-party appears to be providing open versions of a government dataset, please provide links and details here.

Start your answer with 'YES' or 'NO' and then provide details.

In addition to answering these supplementary questions you should also add a note against the drop-down selection box outlining the steps you took to search for this category of data. This will help simplify the review process, allowing the reviewer to check that you have located all relevant sources.
Search tips: locating datasets online

If the government has a central open data portal search here first
If you are not sure if the country has an open data portal search the web for relevant mentions. You might also find data portals from specific departments, particularly national statistics agencies.

You can also find a list of known Open Government Data portals at http://census.okfn.org/catalogs/ and the Reneasler Polytechnic in the United States have brought together the contents of over 40 open data catalogues at http://logd.tw.rpi.edu/demo/international_dataset_catalog_search

Note: neither of these sources are authoritative, and may contain outdated data, or may miss out on data, particularly information not accessible in English. You should confirm for yourself any information on datasets gathered from these sites.

Check the websites of any government departments or agencies who may be responsible for this dataset - use their internal search features to look for the relevant data or to search for ‘open data’ to see if they contain a listing of available datasets.

Consider using the ‘site:’ and ‘filetype:’ operators in Google search to probe the websites if their in-bult search is not very effective.

Search the web for mentions of this data or any other pointers to a possible dataset.
In addition, to identify whether a dataset is available, and available as open data, you might:

- Enquire with the relevant government department directly;
- Ask on the mailing lists of the local open data community if one exists;
- Consult academics who work with this kind of data to identify whether they have found sources for it;
Using ‘site:’ and ‘filetype:’ operators.

Google search has two advanced search options that can help you locate data.

The ‘site:’ operator restricts search to files indexed by Google on the site(s) you specify.

For example, having located the website of the Geospatial agency in Indonesia I can run the search:

```
    site:bakosurtanal.go.id "open data"
```

to search for mentions of the phrase “open data” anywhere on the website. I could also widen the search to check on any government website using ‘go.id’ as the site. For example:

```
    site:go.id "open data"
```

Using the ‘filetype:’ operator I can look for files of a particular kind. For example:

```
    site:bps.go.id filetype:csv
```

searches the Statistics Indonesia website for any CSV files that may contain relevant statistical data. To explore whether a particular dataset might be available I could guess at something I would expect to find within it and add this to my query.

Guidance for reviewers:

Where a researcher has judged that data was not available, ensure that they have provided a detailed explanation of the search they undertook and sources consulted. This should include primary research, and not just finding a dataset was judged non-existent in existing third-party listings.
Datasets:

Below you will find a list of dataset categories to be assessed, along with an operational definition of those categories. Examples are given of data that might fit into this category. The examples are not necessarily 'open data', but simply indicate the kinds of data that would meet the requirements of the question.

D1. Map Data (full coverage of the country)

A detailed digital map of the country provided by a national mapping agency and kept updated with key features such as official administrative borders, roads and other important infrastructure. Please look for maps of at least a scale of 1:250,000 or better (1cm = 2.5km).

Examples:

The United Kingdom mapping agency, the Ordnance Survey, provides open data mapping products for download:
http://www.ordnancesurvey.co.uk/oswebsite/opendata/discover.html

The United States Census.gov site provides detailed mapping products for download:
http://www.census.gov/geo/maps-data/

The Mozambique mapping agency at

D2. Land Ownership Data

A dataset that provides national level information on land ownership. This will usually be held by a land registration agency, and usually relies on the existence of a national land registration database.

Examples:

The New Zealand Land Registry makes data on ‘land parcels’ available as open data as listed at http://data.govt.nz/dataset/show/1333

The UK Land Registry publishes monthly residential sales ‘Price Paid’ data on land transactions at
This news story reveals that Delhi has implemented a GIS system for land ownership, but also implies that a national land ownership database does not currently exist.

D3. Question intentionally left blank
There is no D3 question in the survey.

D4. National Statistics

Key national statistics such as demographic and economic indicators (GDP, unemployment, population, etc), often provided by a National Statistics Agency. Aggregate data (e.g. GDP for whole country at a quarterly level, or population at an annual level) is considered acceptable for this category.

Examples:

The Moldovan Open Data Portal contains datasets on population distribution drawn from the Census.

Detailed bulk data tables from the UKs 2011 Census are available online.

Statistics Canada provide in depth census tables and other national statistics for download.

D5. Detailed government budget

National government budget at a high level (e.g. spending by sector, department etc). Budgets are government plans for expenditure, (not details of actual expenditure in the past which is covered in the spend category).

Research tips:

The Open Budget Survey (not universal coverage) regularly assesses whether budget data is available from a government http://survey.internationalbudget.org/.

The OpenSpending.org platform have brought together many budget datasets, and may help you locate whether the government is publishing open budget data or not. In some cases data is being made available on open spending by third-parties converting from printed or PDF budget records. In these cases you can judge that data is available, but should decide whether or not this is sustainable, given the effort required on the part of civil society.

Examples:

South Africa publishes detailed information on the countries budget online at http://www.treasury.gov.za/documents/national%20budget/default.aspx - a search on the site for xls files (using google> ‘site:treasury.gov.za filetype:xls budget’) suggests that datasets for elements of the budget may also be available, although further investigation is needed to confirm.

The UK Data Portal lists the PESA budget dataset at http://data.gov.uk/dataset/hmt-pesa09-chapter1

D6. Detailed data on government spend

Records of actual (past) national government spending at a detailed transactional level; at the level of month to month government expenditure on specific items (usually this means individual records of spending amounts under $1m or even under $100k). Note: A database of contracts awarded or similar is not sufficient for this category, which refers to detailed ongoing data on actual expenditure.

Examples:

The Uruguay Office of Planning and Budget publish a visualisation of public spending, along with underlying datasets: http://agev.opp.gub.uy/advni/

The UK has mandated detailed publication of all government spend over £25,000 and over 500 spend datasets can be found at data.gov.uk: http://data.gov.uk/data/search?tags=spend-transactions

D7. Company register

A list of registered (limited liability) companies in the country including name, unique identifier and additional information such as address, registered activities. The data in this category does not need to include detailed financial data such as balance sheet etc.

Research tips:

The Wikipedia list of company registrars by country may prove useful in research: http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/List_of_company_registers

OpenCorporates.com have scraped data from many different corporate registries. Each record should link back to it’s source, pointing you to details of the government held data. If the data only appears to be available in bulk form on Open Corporates, and is not available in bulk from the government, then do not award the dataset a mark for sustainability.
Examples:

UK Companies House list a ‘free public data product’ on their company information pages, which consists of a download of basic company information.

D8. Legislation

The constitution and laws of a country.

Please detail whether the data source covers all the laws of the country, or only a sub-set thereof.

Research tips:

Legislative open data will often be provided using eXtensible Markup Language (XML), so searching for ‘[country] legislation XML’ may help locate open legislation data.

Examples:

The UK Legislation.gov.uk site provides laws as structured data as described in this Legislation as open data presentation. The site provides stable URLs for laws.


D9. Public transport timetables

Details of when and where public transport services such as buses and rail services are expected to run. Please provide details for both bus and rail services if applicable.

If no national data is available, please check and provide details related to the capital city.

Research tips:

Sometimes transport information is provided through an ‘API’ (Application Programming Interface) rather than as bulk downloads.

The GTFS data exchange provides details of many local areas sharing public transport data http://www.gtfs-data-exchange.com/agencies/bylocation

Examples:
The Traveline National Dataset of public transport timetables provides UK public transport timetables.

Labs Ruter provide an API onto real-time transport information for Norway, released under an open license.

D10. International trade data

Details of the import and export of specific commodities and/or balance of trade data against other countries.

Examples:

Data.gov.uk lists a range of trade statistics available under the Open Government License.

The Central Statistics Organisation of Afghanistan publish a list of exports by commodity and country in an Excel spreadsheet on their website, along with other trade statistics.

D11. Health sector performance

Statistics generated from administrative data that could be used to indicate performance of specific services, or the healthcare system as a whole.

The performance of health services in a country has a significant impact on the welfare of citizens. Look for ongoing statistics generated from administrative data that could be used to indicate performance of specific services, or the healthcare system as a whole.

Health performance data might include:

- Levels of vaccination;
- Levels of access to health care;
- Health care outcomes for particular groups;
- Patient satisfaction with health services;

Research tips:

The Global Health Data Exchange maintain country profiles and a repository of datasets for countries across the world. The advanced search can be used to find ‘Administrative Record’ data types. This can help you locate national sources of health data, and explore whether these are open datasets. Not all the sources listed on the Exchange are from national governments, so check carefully when exploring available data.
National ministry of health websites are a useful starting point for a health data search in countries that do not have a national open data portal.

**Examples:**

The [UK Department of Health](https://www.gov.uk/government/organisations/department-of-health) publish extensive statistics on the performance of the health service.

The [Kenya Open Data Portal](https://open.data.gov.ke) includes statistics on levels of immunisation in the country, although the data is not updated.

**D12. Primary and secondary education performance data**

The performance of education services in a country has a significant impact on the welfare of citizens. Look for ongoing statistics generated from administrative data that could be used to indicate performance of specific services, or the education system as a whole.

Performance data might include:

- Test scores for pupils in national examinations;
- School attendance rates;
- Teacher attendance rates

Simple lists of schools do not qualify as education performance data.

**Examples:**

The [Kenya Open Data Portal](https://open.data.gov.ke) includes a range of education datasets, including attendance and test score statistics.


[The New Zealand Open Data Portal](https://www.data.govt.nz/) lists a range of education and learning outcomes datasets, including primary and secondary school achievements.

**D13. Crime statistics**

Annual returns on levels of crime and/or detailed crime reports.

Crime statistics can be provided at a variety of levels of granularity, from annual returns on levels of crime, to detailed real-time crime-by-crime reports published online and geolocated, allowing the creation of crime maps.
Research tips:

Look for data from a national criminal records agency, or policing department.

**Examples:**
- The Indian [National Crime Records Bureau](https://www.ncrbo.gov.in/) publish annual crime and prison statistics.
- The [UK Police Force](https://www.gov.uk/government/collections/crime-data) publishes street level crime data on a monthly basis, sharing the location of individual crime reports.

D14. Environmental data

Data on one or more of: carbon emissions, emission of pollutants (e.g. carbon monoxides, nitrogen oxides, particulate matter etc.), and deforestation. Please provide links to sources for each if available.

**Examples:**
- The [UK Department for Food and Rural Affairs](https://www.gov.uk/government/organisations/department-for-food-rural-affairs) maintain an archive of air quality information.
- The [Mexican ‘Your Government Maps’ service](https://www.yourgovernmentmaps.com/) provides maps on a variety of environmental indicators.

D15. National election results

Results by constituency / district for the most all national electoral contests over the last ten years. If only partial data is available please provide details.

**Examples:**
- The [Swedish Election Authority](https://www.valstval.se/) provide detailed downloads of election information, returns and results.
- The [UK Electoral Commission](https://www.gov.uk/government/collections/election-results) publish a spreadsheet of recent election results.

D16. Public contracting data

*Details of the contracts issued by the national government.*
Governments enter into many contracts for the provision of goods and services. Through websites publishing tenders, government contract finder websites, procurement portals and contract websites they may make information about the tender (request for bids) and award (details of who received the contract and it’s value) online.

When answering this question please look for sources that provide contract award data (i.e. details of the fact a contract has been put in place, not only the request for bids). If only solicitation/tenders are available, please note this in your description of the available data.

Look for services that aggregate data from across government - not just single departmental websites. However, if no such service is available, check a selection of the biggest government departments and note if they publish their contract data in any form.

When looking for open data from a contracts portal, look for options to ‘export’ searches or feeds. If a national data portal exists, check here for national government contract data.

Examples:

The United Kingdom Contracts Finder website provides information on tenders and awarded contracts. It provides data feeds and on the data.gov.uk website there are details of a regularly updated data dump for this site.